

NECA's HERITAGE & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE REPORT

The following development proposals were reviewed by the H & D Committee between 2018 and 2019.

1) 255 MACKAY STREET

Proposal: To transform the historic manse of MacKay United Church into two semi-detached residential dwellings. The Committee endorsed the proposal based on the following criteria:

- The property was being returned to residential use
- The expansion of the original dwelling into two units offered a restrained and realistic approach to the viable use of this property
- The significant architectural features of the original house were to be retained
- The materials proposed for the addition were to be identifiably distinct from the existing brick house but were not going to overwhelm it.

As required by the *Ontario Heritage Act* the project proposal was reviewed by the city's Built Heritage Sub-committee, the Planning Committee and City Council. It was approved, but the decision was appealed to the Ontario Municipal Board (OMB) by two adjacent property owners. This appeal was denied so that the project can proceed. As of this month, the property is now officially owned by Routeburn Urban Developments. NECTAR will continue to offer its current roster of programs in the building under a lease agreement with the new owner until March 30, 2020.

2) 60 STANLEY AVENUE

Proposal: To 're-face' the front of a modest 5-storey apartment building at the corner of Charles Street. The project would involve an alternative facade being constructed over the building's existing brick face, composed of dark grey, light grey and white fibre cement panels. The original windows would be removed and replaced with ones that are larger and more contemporary in style. The Committee did not support the proposed alteration of the facade, as the design does not follow the directive spelled out in Section 8.5.3. of the New Edinburgh Heritage Conservation Plan which states: "Alterations and additions to non-contributing buildings will be designed to be compatible with the contributing buildings of the district and in particular the streetscape, in terms of scale, massing, height, setbacks, entry level, materials and windows". (See NEN February issue, page 5 for details). A building application has been submitted, but no heritage application has been received by the city's heritage staff which will be required to allow the city's review process to proceed.

3) 90 CRICHTON STREET

Proposal: To demolish the existing bungalow-style home and replace it with a 2- storey house built on the same footprint as the original. The Committee determined that the proposal meets the objectives for New Development and for Landscapes and Streetscapes as outlined in Sections 7.3 and 7.4 of New Edinburgh's Heritage Conservation District Plan, and will contribute to the HCD in terms of its elegant design and proposed use of quality materials. The project is now under construction.

4) 14 NOEL STREET

Proposal: To demolish the existing 2-storey house, and replace it with a low-rise apartment building containing five (5) units. The Committee supported the proposed building design which reflects the massing and materials of the surrounding buildings (red brick and stucco), and because the redevelopment proposal for this site adheres to the by-laws governing maximum building height, setbacks, parking and landscaped amenity spaces. However, after receiving input from concerned neighbours, the Committee voted not to endorse the applicant's request to change the existing zoning (which permits a maximum of 3 apartment units) to allow for a 5-unit building. This appears to be tantamount to 'spot zoning' and could set a negative precedent for future over-development of other residential sites on Noel and the subsequent loss of green space. At the moment, the application to

proceed with the project is 'on-hold' pending further consultation with City Planning, the property owner and community representatives.

5) 54 DUFFERIN ROAD

Proposal: to demolish an existing L-shaped white clapboard structure which has been neglected and gradually deteriorating, and construct a square 3-storey single family residence designed by Barry Hobin. The Committee endorsed this redevelopment proposal. The new house will be a visually strong and handsome structure combining both modern and classical elements. It is sited well on the lot, allowing for landscaping along the Dufferin and MacKay street frontages. The driveway entrance is off MacKay Street leading to a garage door which is not visible from the street. The design will add a distinguished presence to a very important corner. Its immediate neighbours include the MacKay United Church, the landscaped grounds of Rideau Hall, MacKay House, and it sits at the gateway to New Edinburgh's Heritage Conservation District.

6) 201 Crichton Street

Proposal: Vert Design proposes to renovate the existing 1870's single family home, to demolish its two older additions and attached garage and construct a new 2-storey addition to the house with a roof which matches the form and height of the original home fronting on Crichton Street. The preliminary proposal was not endorsed by the Committee. The primary reservation is that the proposed addition creates a huge solid envelope which will overwhelm the modest original heritage house, cover a large portion of the lot and will loom over the neighbour's property at 199 Crichton Street. The design and massing of what is being proposed does not fulfill the prime objectives for additions or new construction laid out in New Edinburgh's Heritage Conservation Plan.

- “ All additions to contributing buildings shall be complementary to the existing building, subordinate to and distinguishable from the original, an comparable in terms of massing, facade proportions and rooflines” (HCD Plan/page 25).
- “To ensure that any infill or new construction respects and is compatible with the architectural character of the HCD, and respects the same scale and massing of existing adjacent buildings and the broader streetscape - in this case River Lane. (HCD Plan/ Page 13/ 7.3i)
- “ To ensure the 19th Century pattern of lot development is maintained and and respected. ie: long narrow lots with houses facing onto a primary street and landscaped gardens extending to the laneways”. (HCD Plan/Page 13/3iii).

This is a project proposal still in the consultation stage.

Gail McEachern
Chair, Heritage & Development Committee
New Edinburgh Community Alliance